

HIST 585-007

(taught in Fall 2006)

Writing History, Fighting History. Controversies in German Historiography after 1945

Thursday, 4-7pm – Woodruff 874

Instructor: Prof. Astrid M. Eckert

Office: 125 Bowden Hall, Phone: 404-727 1096

Email: aeckert@emory.edu

Office Hours: Wednesday, 11-12am, 4-5pm, and by appointment

Course Description:

In a recent article, the historian Mary Fulbrook noted that “one of the most striking features of German contemporary history to someone socialized within Anglo-American academia is the extraordinarily close relationship which in Germany is often assumed to exist between historical approaches and positions on the political spectrum.” For better or worse, German historical debates have taken on “dimensions of personal involvement and vituperation that, witnessed by outsiders, might seem not merely out of proportion but indeed entirely out of place in the academic world.” Why has German historiography been so politicized and its debates so acrimonious?

This seminar investigates key controversies within the German historical profession since the end of the Second World War. The aim of the course is to familiarize students with central questions in German history while exploring issues and approaches in historical method. Beyond an examination of the specific historiographical questions at stake in these debates and a re-consideration of the texts that ignited the controversies, the seminar will provide students with a broad framework to track and analyze the shifting place of National Socialism and the Holocaust within German historiography. Because many of these debates – particularly the Fischer Controversy, the debate about the German *Sonderweg*, and the Goldhagen controversy – involved historians from outside Germany, the course will acquaint students with the complex positionality of writing and thinking about German history.

Course Requirements:

Active class participation: 50%

Historiographical Essay: 50%

Active class participation means arriving at class prepared to discuss the week’s readings. For class preparation, I strongly recommend that you find out basic biographical information about the scholars and other personalities involved in the controversies we examine.

Each of you will pick one date to **report on the “presented readings”**. Some of the readings to be presented in class are in German, so those of you who read German will soon become immensely popular. The readings slated for presentation are rather uneven in quantity. We will work out individual solutions for your presentation.

Each of you will **write an introduction to one class meeting** and **facilitate our discussion** of that meeting. The introduction will be a short text (1-2 paragraphs) summarizing the scholarly debate we examine that day, mapping out what – in your opinion – was/is at stake in that debate, and pointing out some key questions that you think we should address in the class

meeting. You will post the introduction on our LL conference by Tuesday, 6pm. You will also lead the discussion of that class meeting, at least for the first hour or so.

Each of you will write one **historiographical paper** (~20pp.) relating to German history. In an ideal case, you will find a historiographical debate that connects to your own honors thesis or dissertation work. The debate you research does not need to be as high profile as the ones on the syllabus. Please see me during office hours early in the semester to discuss a possible topic. The paper is **due December 12**.

Core Readings:

AVAILABLE FOR PURCHASE AT THE DRUID HILL BOOKSTORE IN EMORY VILLAGE:

Berger, Stefan: *The Search for Normality. National Identity and Historical Consciousness in Germany since 1800* (Providence, RI: Berghahn, 2nd ed., 2004).

Blackbourn, David and Geoff Eley (eds.): *The Peculiarities of German History. Bourgeois Society and Politics in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (Oxford University Press, 1984).

Eley, Geoff: *A Crooked Line. From Cultural History to the History of Society* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005).

Maier, Charles S.: *The Unmasterable Past. History, Holocaust, and German National Identity* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1988).

Müller, Jan Werner: *Another Country. German Intellectuals, Unification and National Identity* (New Haven: Yale, 2000).

Wehler, Hans-Ulrich: *The German Empire, 1871-1918* (1st German ed. 1973; Engl. trans. 1985, Berg Publishing)

ON 1 DAY RESERVE:

Berger, *The Search for Normality*

Blackbourn/Eley, *Peculiarities of German History*

Fischer, *Germany's Aims in the First World War*

Goldhagen, *Hitler's Willing Executioners*

Maier, *The Unmasterable Past*.

Müller, *Another Country*.

Wehler, *The German Empire, 1871-1918*

Forever in the Shadow of Hitler? Original documents of the Historikerstreit

For older publications such as Eley/Blackbourn's *Peculiarities* or Wehler's *German Empire*, you may want to check online sites for used books.

Core readings must be read by **everyone**; some readings will be presented by students who will report about them in class; further readings are listed to offer background for future reference.

Finding Articles: Some articles are placed on E-reserve. Other articles are available through the library's databases (JSTOR, for example). You will receive copies of some articles directly from the professor.

NOTE that the further we move historiographically into the present, the more difficult it becomes to find a corpus of English language literature on the controversies we will study. For obvious reasons, the core texts (for our purposes, you can think of them as primary sources) were written in German. You will find that a compilation of multiple essays, rather than one core text, provides the best overview and basis for understanding of more recent controversies.

Course Schedule:**Week 1, September 7: The Peculiarities of German Historiographical Controversies**Core Readings:

Fulbrook, Mary: “Approaches to German Contemporary History since 1945: Politics and Paradigms”, *Zeithistorische Forschungen/Studies in Contemporary History* 1:1 (2004), 31-50. (available online at (<http://www.zeithistorische-forschungen.de>))

Further Readings: (on historical controversies in the German profession, pertinent to many controversies we will study over the course of the term)

Grosse Kracht, Klaus: *Die zankende Zunft. Historische Kontroversen in Deutschland nach 1945* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2005).

Lehmann, Hartmut (ed.): *Historikerkontroversen* (Göttingen: Wallstein 2001).

Niethammer, Lutz: “Über Kontroversen in der Geschichtswissenschaft,” in Ulrich Herbert, Dirk van Laak (eds.) *Deutschland danach. Postfaschistische Gesellschaft und nationales Gedächtnis* (Bonn: Dietz, 1999), 414-423.

Sabrow, Martin, Ralph Jessen, Klaus Große Kracht (eds.): *Zeitgeschichte als Streitgeschichte: Große Kontroversen nach 1945* (Munich: Beck, 2003).

Week 2, September 14: The German Historical Profession in the 20th CenturyCore Readings:

Berger, Stefan: *The Search for Normality. National Identity and Historical Consciousness in Germany since 1800* (Providence, RI: Berghahn, 2nd ed., 2004).

Hamerow, Theodore S.: “Guilt, Redemption, and Writing German History,” *American Historical Review* 88 (1983), 53-72.

Further Readings: (overviews on the German historical profession)

Conrad, Sebastian: *Auf der Suche nach der verlorenen Nation. Geschichtsschreibung in Westdeutschland und Japan 1945-1960* (Göttingen: V&R, 1999).

Dorpalen, Andreas: *German History in Marxist Perspective. The East German Approach* (Detroit, MI: Wayne State UP, 1988) [deals with the East German profession while it still existed]

Evans, Richard J.: *Rereading German History, 1800-1996. From Unification to Reunification* (London: Routledge 1997). [reprint of Evans’ articles and reviews relating to seminal works in German history or historiographical trends]

Iggers, Georg G.: *The German Conception of History. The National Tradition of Historical thought from Herder to the Present* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, revised edition, 1983).

Jarausch, Konrad H. and Michael Geyer: *Shattered Past. Reconstructing German Histories* (Princeton University Press, 2003, part I (Ch. 1-3)).

Raphael, Lutz: *Geschichtswissenschaft im Zeitalter der Extreme: Theorie, Methoden, Tendenzen von 1900 bis zur Gegenwart* (Munich: Beck, 2003).

Nolte, Paul: “Die Historiker der Bundesrepublik. Rückblick auf eine ‘lange Generation’”, *Merkur* 53:5 (1999), 413-432.

Sabrow, Martin: *Das Diktat des Konsens. Geschichtswissenschaft in der DDR 1949-1969* (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2001). [on the East German profession after it had disappeared]

Schulze, Winfried: *Deutsche Geschichtswissenschaft nach 1945* (Munich: dtv, 1993).

Week 3, September 21: The Continuity of Military Aggression: The Fischer Controversy

Core Readings:

- Fischer, Fritz: *Germany's Aims in the First World War* (New York: Norton, 1967; German 1st ed. 1961), Ch. 1-3 (pp. 3-119).
- Fischer, Fritz: "Twenty-Five Years Later: Looking Back at the Fischer Controversy and Its Consequences," *Central European History* 21 (1988), 207-223. [Here Fischer, age 80, takes a last shot at his critics. The same issue of CEH features an article by K. Jarausch on "Bethmann Hollweg Revisited"]
- Stelzel, Philipp: "Fritz Fischer and the American Historical Profession: Tracing the Transatlantic Dimension of the *Fischer-Kontroverse*," *Storia della Storiografia* 44 (2003), 67-84.
- Stern, Fritz: "German Historians and the War. Fischer and His Critics", in Stern, *The Failure of Illiberalism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1992), 147-158.

Presented Readings:

- Archival material: Excerpt from Fischer's research diary and correspondence, 1959-61. (In German, available from me.)
- Stibbe, Matthew: "The Fischer Controversy over German War Aims in the First World War and its Reception by East German Historians, 1961-1989", *Historical Journal* 46:3 (2003), 649-668. [The Fischer controversy was a welcome occasion for GDR historians to critique their "bourgeois" West German colleagues. Fischer's research was strongly supported by East German archives, and East German historians concurred in his findings.]

Further Readings:

- Berghahn, Volker: "Fritz Fischer und seine Schüler," *Neue Politische Literatur* 19 (1974), 143-154. [A review article on the occasion of Fischer's 65th birthday]
- Berghahn, Volker: "Die Fischer-Kontroverse – 15 Jahre danach," *Geschichte & Gesellschaft* 6 (1980), 403-419.
- Große Kracht, Klaus: "Fritz Fischer und der deutsche Protestantismus," *Zeitschrift für Neuere Theologiegeschichte* 10:2 (2003), 224-252. [This questions Fischer's *völkisch* views as a young man. The article elicited strong response in newspapers by Fischer supporters. (Available from me upon request.)]
- Jarausch, Konrad: "Der nationale Tabubruch. Wissenschaft, Öffentlichkeit und Politik in der Fischer-Kontroverse," in Martin Sabrow, Ralph Jessen, Klaus Große Kracht, eds., *Zeitgeschichte als Streitgeschichte. Große Kontroversen seit 1945* (Munich: Beck, 2003), 20-40.
- Langdon, John: *July 1914. The Long Debate, 1918-1990* (New York: Berg, 1991).
- Mombauer, Annika: *The Origins of the First World War: Controversies and Consensus* (London: Longman, 2002).
- Moses, John A.: *The Politics of Illusion. The Fischer Controversy in German Historiography* (New York: Barnes & Noble, 1975).
- Schulin, Ernst: "Weltkriegserfahrung und Historikerreaktion" In: Wolfgang Küttler, Jörn Rüsen, Ernst Schulin (eds.): *Geschichtsdiskurs 4: Krisenbewußtsein, Katastrophenerfahrung und Innovation 1880-1945* (Frankfurt: Fischer 1997), 165-188.

Further Watching:

Interview with Fritz Fischer (DVD), IN GERMAN ONLY; available at Music Media Library, Call # DVD 6016 and 6017

- 1) **Fritz Fischer, Biography** – Interview with Fritz and Margarete Fischer - Hamburg, February 24, 1988 (37min; IWF Göttingen 1990): His parents' house - Childhood in Upper Franconia - Outbreak of World War I as formative experience - From Protestant theology to history: School days in Catholic Eichstätt;

studies in theology in Erlangen and Berlin, habilitation on M.A. von Bethmann-Hollweg - Motives for entering the Nazi Party – Frank's Reich Institute for History - On German historians during NS - Military service and POW experience - From the History of the Reformation to contemporary history - Outbreak of the World War I as research object, experiences abroad, early essays, "Reaching for World Power" - Problems: family-career.

2) **Fritz Fischer on Germany's War Aims 1914/1918** - Hamburg, February 24, 1988 (34min; IWF Göttingen 1990): Proceeding from his works "Reaching for World Power" and "War of Illusions." Fischer primarily discusses the history of these works' origin and reception: German world power illusions before 1914 - Germany's sole responsibility for World War II? - Tendencies toward self-overestimation in Wilhelm II. - Bethmann Hollweg's moderating influence - War objectives in West and Eastern Europe, Africa and in the Orient - Edition of the Rietzler Diaries - Continuity Wilhelm II to Hitler?

Week 4, September 28: Before and After Fischer: Writing German and European History in the United States

Core Readings:

- Berghahn, Volker R. and Charles Maier: "Modern Europe in American Historical Writing," in Anthony Molho, Gordon S. Wood (eds.), *Imagined Histories. American Historians Interpret the Past* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), 393-414.
- Krieger, Leonard: "European History in America," in John Higham, ed., *History* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1965), 235-313.
- Stern, Fritz: "German History in America, 1884-1984," *Central European History* 19 (1986), 131-163. [also as "Americans and the German Past: A Century of American Scholarship," in Stern, *Dreams and Delusions. The Drama of German History* (New York: Knopf, 1987), 243-273].]

Further Readings:

- Berghahn, Volker: "Deutschlandbilder 1945-1965. Angloamerikanische Historiker und moderne deutsche Geschichte," in Ernst Schulin, ed.: *Deutsche Geschichtswissenschaft nach dem Zweiten Weltkrieg 1945-1965* (Munich: Oldenbourg, 1989).
- Jaraus, Konrad: "Die Provokation des 'Anderen.' Amerikanische Perspektiven auf die deutsche Vergangenheitsbewältigung," in Arnd Bauerkämper, Martin Sabrow, Bernd Stöver, eds., *Doppelte Zeitgeschichte. Deutsch-deutsche Beziehungen 1945-1990* (Bonn: Dietz Nachfl., 1998), 432-446.
- Lehmann, Hartmut, James J. Sheehan, eds.: *An Interrupted Past. German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States after 1933* (New York: Cambridge UP, 1991).
- Lehmann, Hartmut and James V. H. Melton, eds.: *Paths of Continuity. Central European Historiography from the 1930s to the 1950s* (New York: Cambridge UP, 1994).
- Meinecke, Friedrich: *Akademischer Lehrer und emigrierte Schüler. Briefe und Aufzeichnungen (1910-1977)*, ed. by Gerhard A. Ritter (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2006).
- Sorkin, David: "The Émigré Synthesis: 'German-Jewish History in Modern Times'," *Central European History* 34:4 (2001), 531-559.

Week 5, October 5: Germany's Special Path: The Sonderweg Debate

Core Readings:

- Wehler, Hans-Ulrich: *The German Empire, 1871-1918* (1st German ed. 1973; available in 1985 Engl. ed. by Berg Publ.).
- Lorenz, Chris: "Beyond Good and Evil? The German Empire of 1871 and Modern German Historiography," *Journal of Contemporary History* 30:4 (1995), 729-765. [This article will give you an overview of how research on the *Kaiserreich* developed over the years. It takes the story up to the early '90s. It should be helpful to place Wehler's *German Empire* in historiography.]

Presented Readings:

- Nipperdey, Thomas: "Wehlers 'Kaiserreich.' Eine kritische Auseinandersetzung," in Nipperdey, *Gesellschaft, Kultur, Theorie* (Göttingen: V&R 1976) [Nipperdey is Wehler's foremost German critic. This article was first printed in *Geschichte und Gesellschaft* 1 (1975), the journal founded by Wehler.]

Further Readings:

- Faulenbach, Bernd: *Ideologie des deutschen Weges. Die deutsche Geschichte in der Historiographie zwischen Kaiserreich und Nationalsozialismus* (Munich: Beck, 1980).
- Fletcher, Roger: "Recent Developments in West German Historiography: The Bielefeld School and Its Critics," *German Studies Review* 7 (1984), 451-480.
- Eley, Geoff: *A Crooked Line. From Cultural History to the History of Society* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005). [Eley maps out the major shifts in historical scholarship over the last 40 years. Refers frequently to German history in the U.S. and GB. Partly memoir-style.]
- Nolte, Paul: "Darstellungsweisen deutscher Geschichte. Erzählstrukturen und 'master narratives' bei Nipperdey und Wehler," in Christoph Conrad/Sebastian Conrad, eds.: *Die Nation schreiben. Geschichtswissenschaft im internationalen Vergleich* (Göttingen: V&R, 2002), 236-268.
- Moeller, Robert G.: "The Kaiserreich Recast? Continuity and Change in Modern German Historiography," *Journal of Social History* 17 (1984), 655-680.
- Sperber, Jonathan: "Master Narratives of 19th Century Germany History," *Central European History* 24:1 (1991), 69-91. [reviews the German histories of Wehler, Nipperdey and Sheehan.]
- Wehler, Hans-Ulrich, ed.: *Sozialgeschichte heute. Festschrift für Hans Rosenberg* (Göttingen: V&R, 1974). [snapshot of West German social history in early 70s with contributions by its leading practitioners].
- Welskopp, Thomas: "Die Sozialgeschichte der Väter. Grenzen und Perspektiven der Historischen Sozialwissenschaft," *Geschichte und Gesellschaft* 24 (1998), 173-198.
- Welskopp, Thomas: "Grenzüberschreitungen. Deutsche Sozialgeschichte zwischen den dreißiger und den siebziger Jahren des 20. Jahrhunderts," in Christoph Conrad/Sebastian Conrad, eds.: *Die Nation schreiben. Geschichtswissenschaft im internationalen Vergleich* (Göttingen: V&R, 2002), 296-332.

Week 6, October 12: The Sonderweg Debate, Part II

Core Readings:

- Blackbourn, David and Geoff Eley (eds.): *The Peculiarities of German History. Bourgeois Society and Politics in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (Oxford UP, 1984).
- Kocka, Jürgen: "German History before Hitler. The Debate about the German *Sonderweg*," *Journal of Contemporary History* 23 (1988), 3-16.
- "Forum: Interview with David Blackbourn and Geoff Eley," *German History* 22:2 (May 2004), 229-245.

Presented Readings:

Hans-Ulrich Wehler, “‘Deutscher Sonderweg’ oder allgemeine Probleme des westlichen Kapitalismus? Zur Kritik an einigen ‘Mythen deutscher Geschichtsschreibung’” *Merkur* 35 (1981), 478-487; Response Eley, *ibid.*, 757-759; response Wehler, *ibid.*, 760; Heinrich August Winkler, “Der deutsche Sonderweg. Eine Nachlese”, *ibid.*, 793-804. [This is a heated exchange over the German version of Blackbourn/Eley, *Peculiarities* and is not for the faint-hearted. The German title appears catchier as *Mythen der deutschen Geschichtsschreibung* (Myths of German History Writing).]

Further Readings:

Evans, Richard J., ed.: *Society and Politics in Wilhelmine Germany* (London: Croom Helm, 1978). [British response to the new West German historiography on *Kaiserreich*]
 Jarausch, Konrad H.: “Modernization, German Exceptionalism, and Post-Modernity: Transcending the Critical History of Society,” in Geyer/Jarausch, *Shattered Past. Reconstructing German Histories* (Princeton UP, 2003), 85-108.
 Niethammer, Lutz: “The German *Sonderweg* after Unification,” in Alter/Monteath, *Rewriting the German Past*, 129-151.
 Welskopp, Thomas: “Identität *ex negativo*: Der ‘deutsche Sonderweg’ als Metaerzählung in der bundesdeutschen Geschichtswissenschaft der 70er und 80er Jahre,” in Jarausch/Sabrow, *Die historische Meistererzählung. Deutungslinien der deutschen Nationalgeschichte nach 1945* (Göttingen: V&R, 2002), 109-139.

Week 7, October 19:**The Flavor of the 80s: *Historikerstreit***Core Readings:

Contributions by Ernst Nolte, Jürgen Habermas, Andreas Hillgruber, Michael Stürmer, Hans Mommsen and Martin Broszat published in: *Forever in the Shadow of Hitler?* [The volume is on library reserve. Feel free to read more than the contributions I distribute in class.]
 Maier, Charles S.: *The Unmasterable Past. History, Holocaust, and German National Identity* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1988).

Presented Readings:

Evans, Richard J.: “The New Nationalism and the Old History: Perspectives on the West German *Historikerstreit*”, *Journal of Modern History* 59 (1987), 761-797. [This article later worked into Evans’ *In Hitler’s Shadow. West German Historians and the Attempt to Escape from the Nazi Past* (New York: Pantheon, 1989).]
 Rabinbach, Anson: “The Jewish Question in the German Question,” *New German Critique* 44 (1988).

Further Readings:

Baldwin, Peter (ed.): *Reworking the Past. Hitler, the Holocaust, and the Historians’ Debate* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1990). [This reprints some of the essays that first appeared in *New German Critique*.]
 Baldwin, Peter: “The *Historikerstreit* in Context,” in Baldwin (ed.): *Reworking the Past*, 3-37.
 Berghahn, Volker: “The Unmastered and Unmasterable Past,” in *Journal of Modern History* 63 (1991), 546-554. [Provides a review of Evans, Geiss and C. Maier.]
 Craig, Gordon A.: “The War of the German Historians,” *New York Review of Books* (January 15, 1987).
 Eley, Geoff: “Nazism, Politics and the Image of the Past: Thoughts on the West German *Historikerstreit* 1986-1987,” *Past & Present* 121 (Nov. 1988), 171-208.

- Funke, Hajo: "Bitburg, Jews, and Germans: A Case Study of Anti-Jewish Sentiment in Germany During May 1985", *New German Critique* 38 (1986), 57-72.
- Hartmann, Geoffrey (ed.): *Bitburg in Moral and Political Perspective* (Bloomington, IN: Univ. of Indiana Press, 1986).
- "Historikerstreit". *Die Dokumentation der Kontroverse um die Einzigartigkeit der nationalsozialistischen Judenvernichtung* (Frankfurt, Piper 1987). *Forever in the Shadow of Hitler? Original documents of the Historikerstreit, the controversy concerning the singularity of the Holocaust.* Translated by James Knowlton and Truett Cates (Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press, 1993).
- Muller, Jerry Z.: "German Historians at War," *Commentary* 87 (1989), 33-41.
- Wehler, Hans-Ulrich: *Entsorgung der deutschen Vergangenheit? Ein polemischer Essay zum "Historikerstreit"* (Munich: Beck, 1988).

New German Critique 44 (spring/summer 1988) is devoted solely to the *Historikerstreit* with contributions from Habermas, Mary Nolan, Andrei S. Markovits, Martin Broszat, Saul Friedlaender, Hans-Georg Betz, and Anson Rabinbach.

The German press marked the 20th anniversary of *Historikerstreit* this year with a flood of reports and interviews. If you are interested in this topic, check the *Feuilleton* of the main German papers (Frankfurter Allgemeine, Sueddeutsche Zeitung, Frankfurter Rundschau, Die Welt, Die Zeit)

Week 8, October 26: Unification and the Return of the Nation

Core Readings:

Müller, Jan Werner: *Another Country. German Intellectuals, Unification and National Identity* (New Haven: Yale, 2000).

Further Readings:

- Cary, Noel D.: "'Farewell Without Tears': Diplomats, Dissidents, and the Demise of East Germany," *Journal of Modern History* 73 (2001), 617-651. [overview of literature on end of GDR]
- Jarausch, Konrad H.: *The Rush to German Unity*. (New York: Oxford UP, 1994). [one of the earliest scholarly accounts on the end of the GDR]
- Maier, Charles: *Dissolution. The Crisis of Communism and the End of East Germany* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997).
- Philipsen, Dirk, ed.: *We were the People. Voices from East Germany's Revolutionary Autumn of 1989* (Durham: Duke UP, 1993). [oral history account of GDR opposition; wants to show that events of 1989 were a genuine revolution]
- Pond, Elizabeth: *Beyond the Wall. Germany's Road to Unification* (Washington, D. C.: Brookings, 1993). [considered the first account on German unification; written by an American journalist; day-to-day account of events 1989 in Dresden, Leipzig, Berlin, Bonn, Washington and Moscow.]
- Sheehan, James, "What is German History? Reflections on the Role of the Nation in German History and Historiography", *Journal of Modern History*, Vol. 53, No. 1 (Mar. 1981), 1-23. [A classic text.]
- Spohr, Kristina: "German Unification: Between Official History, Academic Scholarship, and Political Memoirs," *Historical Journal* 43:3 (2000), 869-888.
- Weisbrod, Bernd: "German Unification and the National Paradigm," *German History* 14:2 (1996), 193-207.

Week 9, November 2: Who Writes GDR History? The Disintegration of the East German Historical Profession and the Beginnings of Historicizing the GDR

Core Readings:

- Klessmann, Christoph and Martin Sabrow: "Contemporary History in Germany after 1989," *Contemporary European History* 6:2 (1997), 219-243.
- Lässig, Simone: "Between Two Scholarly Cultures: Reflections on the Reorganization of the East German Historical Profession after 1990," *Central European History* 40:3 (2007), 499-522.
- Pätzold, Kurt: "What new Start? The End of Historical Study in the GDR," *German History* 10 (1992), 392-404.
- Ritter, Gerhard A.: "The Reconstruction of History at the Humboldt University: A Reply," *German History* 11 (1993), 339-345.
- Ross, Corey: *The East German Dictatorship. Problems and Perspectives in the Interpretation of the GDR* (London: Arnold, 2002), Ch. 1-3, 7-8 (pp. 1-68, 149-202).

Presented Readings:

- Ash, Mitchell G.: "Geschichtswissenschaft, Geschichtskultur und der ostdeutsche Historikerstreit," *Geschichte und Gesellschaft* 24 (1998), 283-304.

Further Readings:

- Berger, Stefan: "Historians and Nation-Building in Germany after Reunification," *Past and Present* 148 (1995), 187-222.
- Berger, Stefan: "Former GDR Historians in the Reunified Germany: An Alternative Historical Culture and its Attempts to Come to Terms with the GDR Past," *Journal of Contemporary History* 38 (2003), 63-84. [Includes Berger's views on the end of the GDR historians' profession are also covered in his book *Search for Normality*.]
- Berger, Stefan: „Was bleibt von der Geschichtswissenschaft der DDR? Blick auf eine alternative historische Kultur im Osten Deutschlands,“ *Zeitschrift für Geschichtswissenschaft* 50 (1992), 1016-1034.
- Eckert, Rainer, Ilko-Sascha Kowalczyk and Isolde Stark, eds: *Hure oder Muse? Klio in der DDR.: Dokumente und Materialien des Unabhängigen Historiker-Verbandes* (Berlin: 1994). [This is an indispensable volume. It contains the main contributions to the controversy (newspaper articles, memoranda). We don't have it at the library, but I'd be happy to share my copy.]
- Eckert, Rainer, ed.: *Wer schreibt die DDR-Geschichte? Ein Historikerstreit um Stellen, Strukturen, Finanzen und Deutungskompetenz* (Berlin: Evangel.Akademie Berlin-Brandenburg, 1995). [Proceedings of a workshop.]
- Eckert, Rainer, Wolfgang Küttler, Gustav Seiber, eds.: *Krise, Umbruch, Neubeginn: Eine kritische und selbstkritische Dokumentation der DDR Geschichtswissenschaft 1989/1990* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1992). [Another anthology with press articles, previously unpublished papers and memoranda dating from November 1989 to fall 1990 with an afterword by Jürgen Kocka (Aug. 1992).]
- Engstrom, Eric J.: "Zeitgeschichte as Disciplinary History – On Professional Identity, Self-Reflexive Narratives, and Discipline-Building in Contemporary German History," *Tel Aviver Jahrbuch für deutsche Geschichte* 29 (2000), 399-425.
- Ernst, Anna-Sabine: "A Survey of Institutional Research on the GDR. Between 'Investigative History' and Solid Research: The Reorganization of Historical Studies about the Former German Democratic Republic," *Central European History* 28:3 (1995), 373-395.
- Jarausch, Konrad H. and Matthias Middell, eds.: *Nach dem Erdbeben. (Re-)Konstruktion ostdeutscher Geschichte und Geschichtswissenschaft* (Leipzig: Leipziger Universitätsverlag, 1994). [Proceedings of a May 1992 workshop on the consequences of unification on the writing of German history]
- Jarausch, Konrad H.: "The German Democratic Republic as History in United Germany: Reflections on Public Debate and Academic Controversy," *German Politics and Society* 15:2 (Summer 1997), 33-

48. [This is a special issue of GPS with further articles on post-nationality and German identity after the Wall.]

Lammers, Karl Christian: "The German Democratic Republic as History," *Contemporary European History* 6:3 (1997), 419-425.

Middel, Matthias: "Schwierigkeiten des Historiographievergleichs. Bemerkungen anhand der deutsch-deutschen Nachkriegskonstellation," in Christoph Conrad/Sebastian Conrad, eds.: *Die Nation schreiben. Geschichtswissenschaft im internationalen Vergleich* (Göttingen: V&R, 2002), 360-395.

Sabrow, Martin: "Confrontation and Co-operation: Relations Between the Two German Historiographies," in Klessmann, ed., *The Divided Past. Rewriting Post-War German History* (Oxford: Berg, 2001), 127-147.

Week 10, November 9: Pictures at an Exhibition: *Wehrmachtsausstellung*

Core Readings:

Bartov, Omer: "Whose History Is It, Anyway? The Wehrmacht and German Historiography" in Heer/Naumann, eds.: *War of Extermination. The German Military in World War II, 1941-1944* (New York: Berghahn, 2000), 400-416.

Berghahn, Volker: "Preface" in Heer/Naumann, eds.: *War of Extermination. The German Military in World War II, 1941-1944* (New York: Berghahn, 2000), xii-xix.

Naumann, Klaus: "The 'Unblemished' Wehrmacht. The Social History of a Myth", in Heer/Naumann, eds.: *War of Extermination. The German Military in World War II, 1941-1944* (New York: Berghahn, 2000), 417-429.

Madievski, Samson: "The War of Extermination: The Crimes of the Wehrmacht in 1941-1944", *Rethinking History* 7:2 (2003), 243-254. [An exhibition review: covers first and revised version of exhibition as well as the public reactions to them; gives background on the Hamburg Institute.]

Niven, Bill: *Facing the Nazi Past. United Germany and the Legacy of the Third Reich* (London: Routledge, 2002), 143-174. [The chapter we read was drafted before the revised exhibition was released in 2001.]

Vernichtungskrieg. Verbrechen der Wehrmacht 1941-1944. Ausstellungskatalog (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 1996). [This is the original exhibition catalog with the photographs that were later critiqued as weakness of the exhibition. Engl. trans. *The German Army and Genocide. Crimes Against War Prisoners, Jews, and Other Civilians, 1939-1941* (New York: New Press, 1999) – please familiarize yourselves with the photographs and read as much as you can

Please browse these internet resources:

1) Entries on HGerman's discussion log on *Wehrmacht* exhibition:

<http://www.h-net.org/~german/discuss/other/wehrmacht.htm>

2) The Hamburg Institute for Social Research (HIS) maintains a website about the 2001 version of the exhibition at: <http://www.verbrechen-der-wehrmacht.de/>

You can switch the site to English. It features an outline of the exhibition

[http://www.verbrechen-der-wehrmacht.de/pdf/vdw_en.pdf],

a virtual tour, HIS press releases on the exhibition(s) and press clippings. Our library acquired the DVD-ROM on the exhibition (D757.1 .V47 2004), containing texts, photos, maps and impressions from some cities where the exhibition was displayed (in German only).

Presented Readings:

- Manoschek, Walter: "Austrian Reaction to the Exhibition 'War of Extermination: Crimes of the Wehrmacht, 1941-1944'," *Contemporary Austrian Studies* 7 (1999), 193-200.
- Ardelt, Rudolf G.: "Zumutungen und Auseinandersetzungen: Reflexionen zur Ausstellung 'Vernichtungskrieg' in Linz," *Zeitgeschichte* (Austria) 24:11/12 (1997), 346-364.
- Bundestagsprotokoll for sessions on March 13 and April 24, 1997 [in German only; available from me]

Further Readings:

- Bartov, Omer: *Hitler's Army. Soldiers, Nazi and War in the Third Reich* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1991) [If you need some background on *Wehrmacht*, this is a good place to start.]
- Hamburger Institut für Sozialforschung, ed.: *Eine Ausstellung und ihre Folgen. Zur Rezeption der Ausstellung "Vernichtungskrieg"* (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 1999). [HIS was most active in documenting the controversy on the exhibition. This contains contributions on the reception of the exhibition.]
- Hamburger Institut für Sozialforschung, ed.: *Besucher einer Ausstellung: Die Ausstellung "Vernichtungskrieg" in Interview und Gespräch* (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 1998). [The same as above. This focuses on visitors' reactions to the exhibition in Berlin, Potsdam, Stuttgart, and contains interviews and interpretative essays.]
- Hartmann, Christian, Johannes Hürter, Ulrike Jureit, eds.: *Verbrechen der Wehrmacht. Bilanz einer Debatte* (Munich: Beck, 2005).
- Heer, Hannes & Klaus Naumann, eds.: *War of Extermination. The German Military in World War II, 1941-1944* (New York: Berghahn, 2000). [This is a translation. of *Vernichtungskrieg. Verbrechen der Wehrmacht 1941-1944* (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 1995).]
- Heer, Hannes: "The Difficulty of Ending a War: Reactions to the Exhibition 'War of Extermination: Crimes of the Wehrmacht, 1941-1944'," *History Workshop Journal* 46 (1998), 187-203. [This was first published in *Zeitschrift für Geschichtswissenschaft* 1997.]
- Musial, Bogdan: "Bilder einer Ausstellung. Kritische Anmerkungen zur Wanderausstellung *Vernichtungskrieg*," *Vierteljahrshefte für Zeitgeschichte* 47:4 (1999), 563-591. [This is one of the two substantial critiques of the 1st exhibition that led to its withdrawal.]
- Ungvári, Christian: "Echte Bilder, problematische Aussagen. Eine quantitative und qualitative Analyse des Bildmaterials der Ausstellung 'Vernichtungskrieg'," *Geschichte in Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 10 (1999), 584-595. [This is one of the two substantial critiques of the 1st exhibition that led to its withdrawal.]
- Wette, Wolfram: *The Wehrmacht. History, Myth, Reality* (Cambridge: Harvard UP, 2006) [This is another good place to start if you need some background on German *Wehrmacht*. It's a translation of Wette's *Wehrmacht. Feindbilder, Vernichtungskrieg, Legenden* (2002). Wette is one of the leading German military historians.]

Further Watching: "East of War" (**Jenseits des Krieges**), dir. Ruth Beckermann (Austria), available at Music Media Library, Call # VHS 4499 (German with Engl. Subtitles)
Documentary; chronicles reactions of former Austrian soldiers to the Wehrmacht exhibition as shown in Vienna in 1995

Week 11, November 16: "Eliminatory anti-Semitism"? The Goldhagen ControversyCore Readings:

- Aschheim, Steven E.: "Archetypes and German-Jewish Dialogue: Reflections Occasioned by the Goldhagen Affair," *German History* 15:2 (1997), 240-250.
- Birn, Ruth Bettina: "Revising the Holocaust" [Review of Goldhagen], *Historical Journal* 40:1 (1997), 195-215. [This discusses Goldhagen's empirical (archival) evidence. Goldhagen

- replied in “The Fictions of Ruth Bettina Birn,” *German Politics and Society* 25 (1997), 119-165.]
- Browning, Christopher R.: “Ordinary Germans or Ordinary Men? A Reply to the Critics,” in Michael Berenbaum and Abraham J. Peck (eds.), *The Holocaust and History. The Known, the Unknown, the Disputed, and the Re-examined* (Washington, D. C.: USHMM in coop. with Indiana Univ. Press 1998), 252-265.
- Eley, Geoff: “Ordinary Germans, Nazism, and Judeocide,” in Eley, ed.: *The “Goldhagen Effect”*, 1-31.
- Goldhagen, Daniel J.: *Hitler’s Willing Executioners. Ordinary Germans and the Holocaust* (New York: Knopf, 1996). [Familiarize yourself with the book, its method, & key argument(s).]
- Goldhagen, Daniel J.: “Ordinary Men or Ordinary Germans?” in Michael Berenbaum and Abraham J. Peck (eds.), *The Holocaust and History. The Known, the Unknown, the Disputed, and the Re-examined* (Washington, D. C.: USHMM in coop. with Indiana Univ. Press 1998), 301-307.
- Herbert, Ulrich: “Academic and Public Discourses on the Holocaust. The Goldhagen-Debate in Germany,” *German Politics and Society* 17:3 (1999), 35-54. (online at <http://www.histsem.uni-freiburg.de/herbert/> under the heading “aktuelle Beiträge”)
- Wehler, Hans-Ulrich: “The Goldhagen Controversy: Agonizing Problems, Scholarly Failure and Political Dimension,” *German History* 15:1 (1997), 80-91.

Presented Readings:

- Browning, Christopher R.: *Ordinary Men. Reserve Police Battalion 101 and the Final Solution in Poland*. (New York: HarperCollins, 1992). [2nd ed. (1998) has new afterword relating to the controversy.]

Further Readings:

- Erb, Rainer and Johannes Heil, eds.: *Geschichtswissenschaft und Öffentlichkeit: Der Streit um Daniel J. Goldhagen* (Frankfurt/M.: Fischer Taschenbuch Verlag, 1998),
- Eley, Geoff (ed.): *The “Goldhagen Effect”: History, Memory, Nazism – Facing the German Past* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2000).
- Kwiet, Konrad: “‘Hitler’s Willing Executioners’ and ‘Ordinary Germans’. Some Comments on Goldhagen’s Ideas,” *Jewish Studies Yearbook* 1 (2000) (online at http://www.ceu.hu/jewishstudies/pdf/01_kwiet.pdf)
- LaCapra, Dominick: “Perpetrators and Victims: The Goldhagen Debate and Beyond,” in LaCapra, *Writing History, Writing Trauma* (= ch. 4) (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 2001), 114-140.
- Pohl, Dieter: “Die Holocaust-Forschung und Goldhagens Thesen,” *Vierteljahrshefte für Zeitgeschichte* 45 (1997).
- Schoeps, Julius H. (ed.): *Ein Volk von Mördern? Die Dokumentation zur Goldhagen-Kontroverse um die Rolle der Deutschen im Holocaust* (Hamburg: Hoffmann & Campe 1997). [Documentation of key contributions to the discussion]
- Shandley, Robert R., ed.: *Unwilling Germans? The Goldhagen Debate* (Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1998). [An anthology with contributions to the debate in Germany and U.S.]
- The “Willing Executioners/Ordinary Men” Debate: Selections from the Symposium, April 8, 1996*, introduced by Michael Berenbaum (Washington, D. C.: USHMM, 2001).

Discussion forum on Goldhagen on HGerman:

<http://www.h-net.org/~german/discuss/goldhagen/index.html>

Week 12, November 23: No class – Thanksgiving break**Week 13, November 30: Shaking the Academic Family Tree: Frankfurt 1998 and Historians during National Socialism**

Note that we need to work from articles, reviews, and essays in this session as there is no substantial overview of the debate available in English yet. I will provide a reader with the texts for this session.

Core Readings:

- Berghahn, Volker: Review of Schulze/Oexle, in *CEH* 34 (2001), 134-139.
- Derks, Hans: Review of Schulze/Oexle, in *German History* 19 (2001), 122-127.
- Derks, Hans: "German Historians, Sociologists and the Holocaust", *The European Legacy* 6:4 (2001), 491-499. [A review article]
- Fulbrook, Mary: "Much Ado About Something Completely Different?," contribution to HSozKult Review Forum *Versäumte Fragen* (2000).
- Gellately, Robert: "Social Consensus and Germany's Educated Elite in the Shadow of Nazism", contribution to HSozKult Review Forum *Versäumte Fragen* (2000).
- Jarausch, Konrad H.: "Unasked Questions: The Controversy about Nazi Collaboration among German Historians," in *Lessons and Legacies. Volume VI: New Currents in Holocaust Research*, ed. Jeffrey M. Diefendorf (Evanston: Northwestern UP, 2004), 190-208.
- Kansteiner, Wulf: "Mandarins in the Public Sphere. *Vergangenheitsbewältigung* and the Paradigm of Social History in the Federal Republic of Germany," *German Politics and Society* 52 (1999): 84-120. [This article will partly be redundant on things we have read already on the *Historikerstreit*, Goldhagen etc.. Focus on the aspects relating to this session.]
- Moses, Dirk A.: "Grinding the Generational Axe," contribution to HSozKult Review Forum *Versäumte Fragen* (2000).

Presented Readings:

- Hohls, Rüdiger and Konrad H. Jarausch, eds: *Versäumte Fragen : Deutsche Historiker im Schatten des Nationalsozialismus* (Stuttgart: DVA, 2000). [An oral history project. Scholars of the (now) older generation are interviewed about how they became historians, how they related to their doctoral advisors, and which 'burning' issues and questions (in)formed their work.]
- Weinreich, Max: *Hitler's Professors. The Part of Scholarship in Germany's Crimes Against the Jewish People* (New York: YIVO, 1946, 2nd ed. Yale University Press, 1999). [Historians frequently referred to this book during the debate since it already asked in 1946 some of the questions that would fuel discussions in the late '90s.]

Further Readings:

- Aly, Götz and Susanne Heim: "*Architects of Annihilation*". *Auschwitz and the Logic of Destruction* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2002) [A translation of *Vordenker der Vernichtung*]
- Berger, Stefan: "Nationalism and Historiography," *German History* 18:2 (2000), 239-259. [A review article. You are already familiar with some of Berger's argument from the book in the first meeting; pp.244-251 relates to today's session.]
- Burleigh, Michael: *Germany Turns Eastwards. A Study of Ostforschung in the Third Reich*. (Cambridge: 1988).
- Ebbinghaus, Angelika and Karl-Heinz Roth: "Vorläufer des 'Generalplan Ost'. Eine Dokumentation ueber Theodor Schieders Polendenkschrift vom 7. Oktober 1939," 1999. *Zeitschrift für Sozialgeschichte des 20. und 21. Jahrhunderts* 1 (1992), 62-94. [One of the key texts in the debate. Schieder's memorandum was treated as one of the 'smoking guns'.]

- Fahlbusch, Michael: *Wissenschaft im Dienst der nationalsozialistischen Politik? Die 'Volksdeutschen Forschungsgemeinschaften' von 1931-1945* (Baden-Baden: Nomos, 1999)
- Haar, Ingo: *Historiker im Nationalsozialismus. Deutsche Geschichtswissenschaft und der "Volkstumskampf" im Osten* (Göttingen: V&R, 2000). [One of the key texts in the debate]
- Haar, Ingo and Michael Fahlbusch: *German Scholars and Ethnic Cleansing (1920-1945)* (New York: Berghahn, 2004). [Introduction by Georg Iggers]
- Melton, Jamie: "From Folk History to Structural History: Otto Brunner and the Radical-Conservative Roots of German Social History," in Hartmut Lehmann and James V. H. Melton, eds.: *Paths of Continuity. Central European Historiography from the 1930s to the 1950s* (New York: Cambridge UP, 1994), 263-292.
- Mühle, Eduard: *Für Volk und deutschen Osten. Der Historiker Hermann Aubin und die deutsche Ostforschung* (Düsseldorf: Droste, 2005).
- Schöttler, Peter (ed.): *Geschichtsschreibung als Legitimationswissenschaft 1918-1945* (Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1999).
- Schulze, Winfried and Otto Gerhard Oexle (eds.): *Deutsche Historiker im Nationalsozialismus* (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1999). [Contains the revised papers of the Frankfurt *Historikertag* session, 1998.]

Online discussion on Rothfels on HSozKult at: http://edoc.hu-berlin.de/e_histfor/1/

Online discussion on "unasked questions" in the profession: <http://hsozkult.geschichte.hu-berlin.de/> (go to "Rezensionen", then to "Review Symposien" to "Versäumte Fragen")

**Week 14, December 7: Normality Ever? The German historical profession,
German history in the United States, and where the
journey might take us**

Core Readings:

Eley, Geoff: *A Crooked Line. From Cultural History to the History of Society* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005).